



**Date:** August 23, 2019

**To:** Strategic Growth Council, Health in All Policies Task Force staff

**From:** Kellie Jean Hogue, Ngan Tran, Ivan Hernandez, Rubén Franco Pescador, Sergio Iribe  
California Research Bureau

**Re:** Request for Information: How have other jurisdictions worked to embed equity?

---

The California Research Bureau was asked in May 2019 to conduct a literature review on racial equity and organizational change in the context of the racial equity capacity building initiative that the Health in All Policies Task Force and the Strategic Growth Council are facilitating in partnership with the Government Alliance on Race and Equity. The following literature review, which includes references to key documents and resources, is in response to the following prompt:

**How have other jurisdictions (i.e., state government, large employers, nonprofits and universities) worked to embed equity (i.e., racial equity, diversity, and/or inclusion considerations) in their programs, policies and organizations?**

Please contact the Research Bureau at [crb@library.ca.gov](mailto:crb@library.ca.gov) or 916-319-2691 if you have questions.

### How have state governments worked to embed equity?

- Vermont recently established a [Racial Equity Advisory Panel](#), and in June 2019 appointed its first [executive director for racial equity](#).
- Michigan created a [Racial Equity Toolkit](#) to provide guidance to government, organizations and communities to guide a [longer term capacity building effort](#) that includes an interagency workgroup, a council for government on equity and inclusion, a truth and racial healing transformation initiative, and equity and inclusion training.
- New York is recently considered [legislation to create a committee on racial equity](#) in the state senate and has expanded this idea into [legislation that proposes to establish a joint legislative committee](#) on racial equity in New York state.
- Nevada has an [Office of Minority Health and Equity](#) based in the Department of Health and Human Resources.
- Texas has worked [to create an equitable health and human services](#) system.
- For a state-by-state evaluation of how states are faring in reaching racial equity attainment goals, see The Education Trust's site entitled [Aiming for Equity](#).

### How have other countries worked to embed equity

- Through their participation in [The Prince's Responsible Business Network](#), a collaborative that includes businesses, agencies, foundations, and other organizations aim to take practice steps toward racial equity in the United Kingdom.

- The United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner houses the [Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination](#) to monitor racial discrimination by participant states. The most recent scorecard is [here](#).
- The international [Institute on Race, Equality and Human Rights](#) is a collaborative organization that works with grassroots organizations in Latin America.
- The [W.K. Kellogg Foundation](#) recently expanded its philanthropic match with Baobá Fund for Racial Equity in Brazil, eight years after Brazil [passed a racial equity law](#).
- Created by the Canadian Race Relations Foundations Act, the [Canadian Race Relations Foundation's](#) purpose is to “facilitate throughout Canada the development, sharing and application of knowledge and expertise in order to contribute to the elimination of racism and all forms of racial discrimination in Canadian society.”

### How have city and county governments worked to embed equity?

- Albuquerque recently released [An Equity Profile of Albuquerque](#).
- The National League of Cities offers guidance on how to [advance racial equity](#) at the city level and features various city profiles ([Boston](#), [Madison](#), [Tacoma](#)) on racial equity.
- As a participant in the 100 Resilient Cities Network Exchange Program (Rockefeller Foundation), Boston created [Resilient Cities at the Forefront: A Practitioners Guide to Action](#).
- Alameda County [launched an initiative to address community health conditions](#) through local policy change.
- [Marin County](#) was one of the first counties in California to adopt a racial equity action plan.
- Dubuque, Iowa has a [racial equity toolkit](#).
- Louisville Metro Government participated in a two-year initiative called [Racial Equity Here](#).
- Montgomery County, Maryland, looked at [Racial Equity in Government Decision Making](#) (in partnership with GARE) and made a set of extensive recommendations.
- Multnomah County, Oregon, developed an [Equity and Empowerment Lens](#), a quality improvement tool to improve planning, decision making and resource allocation toward more racially equitable policies and programs.
- Seattle's [Race and Social Justice Initiative's Vision and Strategic Plan](#) prioritized three issues areas: education, criminal justice, and equitable development. All city of Seattle departments completed annual action plans, available [here](#).
- Portland's [Citywide Racial Equity Goals and Strategies](#) established racial equity as a clear priority and emphasized seven issue areas.
- Dane County, Wisconsin, took a comprehensive approach with [Race to Equity](#).

### How have large employers worked to embed equity?

[Large employers have worked to embed equity](#) in the following ways:

- ShopRite operator [Brown's Super Stores](#) Found a profitable market expansion opportunity by establishing grocery stores in Philadelphia-area food deserts, where predominantly low-income

people of color live. The company offered customized food items and complementary services that were lacking, such as health clinics.

- [PayPal's Working Capital \(PPWC\) loan](#) uses alternative forms of credit assessment and thus eliminates factors traditionally influenced by race. 25% of its loans were in credit-starved counties that are predominantly communities of color.
- [Regions Bank](#) designed the Now Banking suite of products for underbanked and unbanked consumers, many of whom are people of color, so they could cash checks with minimal fees and no minimum account balance.
- [Gap Inc.](#) created a talent pipeline with double the average retention rates by providing a skills training course and a 10-week internship program through the This Way Ahead program. 98% of participants are people of color.
- [Cascade Engineering's Welfare to Career Program](#) has decreased turnover from 65% to 5% by providing wrap-around services to employees previously on welfare. Half of these employees are people of color.
- [Kaiser Permanente](#) found significant disparities in hypertension rates between Whites and Blacks. Then it designed a suite of culturally responsive care strategies that reduced the gap from 6.3% to 2.8% and significantly reduced operating costs.
- [Prudential](#) used its lobbying arm to work with a coalition of organizations to pass a legislation that helps small businesses enroll eligible workers in retirement plans, thus increasing access to retirement savings for people of color while creating a new market for Prudential and its industry.
- [Symantec](#) used its corporate foundation to launch the Symantec Cyber Career Connection, a program that trains and places youth—predominantly people of color—in cybersecurity careers. Symantec plans to scale the program nationally in order to create a more diverse workforce for the entire cybersecurity industry.

## How have non-profits worked to embed equity?

- More than 40 independent, nonprofit research and policy organizations participate in the [State Priorities Partnership](#), which maintains a [Racial Equity Media Library](#).
- The [Montana Racial Equity Project](#) coordinates classroom dialogues, community events, workshops, presentations, training sessions and consultations.
- Supported by the [WK Kellogg Foundation](#), the New Mexico Center on Law and Poverty created [a 10-year plan](#) and Altarum recently released [The Business Case for Racial Equity: New Mexico](#). Similarly, Altarum also recently released [The Business Case for Racial Equity: Mississippi](#), [The Business Case for Racial Equity: Michigan](#) and [The Business Case for Racial Equity in New Orleans and Louisiana](#).
- Based in North Carolina, [The Racial Equity Institute, LLC](#) offers a variety of consultative services and has worked with clients in higher education, healthcare, K-12 education, foundations, non-profits, business/finance, social services, government/community/art/civic/criminal justices and faith-based institutions and organizations.

## How have universities worked to embed equity?

- [Teach-ins, rallies and marches, working groups and task forces](#) are ways that universities have attempted to address racial inequity.
- In addition to having a chief diversity officer, an office of diversity and equity, and minority-based culture centers, recommendations from this [recent University of Southern California report](#) include: (1) increasing minority undergraduate student enrollments, ensuring gender equity in and beyond enrollment, graduating minority students at higher rates, recruiting and retaining minority faculty. The report also suggests establishing cross campus and cross sector teams of faculty, staff, alumni, administrators and undergrad to engage in racial equity work. [Educating faculty and leadership](#) about how to achieve racial equity would be the best first step.
- Personal experience as a foundation program officer, leads [one scholar](#) to suggest that scholars in the field of racial equity should “stop ceding ground to the policy experts and to start embracing the notion that engaged scholarship must also take place in the dingy offices of state legislators and in the ever-so-dry meetings with policy wonks, technology geeks, and nerdy number crunchers.”
- Individual institutional actions—internal racial equity audit—to [“identify the mechanisms of their own institutions contribution to the cumulative relative white advantage”](#) through the reexamination of policies and practices may also embed equity. Similarly, [equity audits](#) could elevate efforts toward racial equity.
- [Race and Ethnicity in Higher Education: A Status Report](#) suggests there is much more to be done to advance racial equity in higher education and offers a data-intensive look at over 200 quantitative indicators.

## What success factors and best practices operationalize equity in the workforce?

- [Equity, Diversity and Inclusion in Recruitment, Hiring and Retention](#), a factsheet, offers practices and tools to support racial equity in the workplace. Tips include: review and rewrite job descriptions, ask for diversity, equity and inclusion statements, focus outreach to communities of color, train resume reviewers and interview panels to be sensitive to implicit bias, review and rewrite interview questions, review onboarding processes, generate support strategies aimed at retention, implement “stay interviews,” institutionalize race equity, diversity and inclusion efforts.
- [A Toolkit for Recruiting and Hiring a More Diverse Workforce](#) offers best practices for recruiting and interviewing. Practices include advertising for diversity, target recruitment activities to underrepresented populations, create opportunities for on the job mentorships and career ladders, demonstrate organizational commitment to diversity.
- [Public Sector Jobs: Opportunities for Advancing Racial Equity](#) details steps to advancing workforce equity in public sector jobs. Steps include: (1) analyze data; (2) support, engage and organize others; (3) use racial equity tools; (4) Create a workplace culture where racial equity is

both a value and is operationalized; (5) Initiate and implement pipe-line development programs; (6) Set goals, track progress and focus on accountability.

- [Best Practices for Achieving Workforce Diversity](#) identifies the following success factors: (1) leadership and management commitment; (2) employee involvement; (3) strategic planning; (4) sustained investment; (5) diversity indicators; (6) accountability, measurement, and evaluation; and (7) linkage to organizational goals and objectives.
- Building a [race equity culture in the workplace](#) involves establishing a shared vocabulary, identifying senior leadership champions, naming race equity work as a strategic imperative, opening a continuous dialogue about race equity work, disaggregating data.

## What success factors and best practices operationalize equity in contracting and granting?

### Contracting equity

- Elected officials can [advance racial equity in public contracting](#) by increasing the number and capacity of minority owned businesses and disadvantaged business enterprises, increasing access to capital, and investing in disparity studies to highlight the need for equity.
- A [study in Portland](#) suggests the following: (1) regional strategies, (2) accountability and data systems, (3) innovations, (4) incentives and sanctions, and (5) discourse and awareness efforts.
- A [GARE brief](#) suggests a comprehensive set of policy and practice strategies, including overcoming past discrimination, flexibility, minimizing unintended consequences, making sure programs are multifaceted, changing the culture, building capacity, and expanding and replication successes where possible.

### Granting equity

- A [study of federal granting](#) suggests linking diversity to educational quality and holding districts accountable, offer guidance as to how race could be used to leaders and attorneys, and find ways to connect leaders who value diversity.
- [Grantmaking with a Racial Equity Lens](#) suggests taking an approach that analyzes data and information about race and ethnicity, understands disparities, looks at problems and their root causes, and names race explicitly. Skills and strategies include: scan the landscape, get people talking, encourage new approaches, cultivate new leadership, rethink merit and who gets to define it, assess impact, and address seemingly intractable problems.

## General themes found in the academic and gray literature

The [Local and Regional Government Alliance on Race & Equity \(GARE\)](#) is very active in this area, developing and supporting regional hubs across the nation. Academic and gray literature concerning racial equity is largely qualitative in nature and dominated by materials (e.g. toolkits, racial equity action plans, white papers, power points) produced by GARE or by another entity (e.g. city, county, institute, center) in conjunction with GARE or having had exposure to GARE-based methods and training. We found smaller sets of literature in this area having to do with health equity, housing

equity, educational equity and environmental equity. Curated resources are available in the OneDrive shared folder.

Concerned that we were unable to find credible, scientifically grounded quantitative research featuring outcomes/impact data focused on racial equity, we sought to identify why. A wealth of quantitative data is available through the [National Equity Atlas](#), which offers comprehensive data summaries by state, region and city for a variety of indicators, equity profiles and reports, and monthly updates as new local and data policy tools come online. However, longitudinal studies with large randomized sample sizes featuring outcomes and impacts (as one would find in the public health literature, for example) were not readily available.

Approaches that place race at the center (e.g. GARE) most likely emerge from [critical race theory](#), a perspective initially grounded in the 1970s in philosophy, history, sociology and law, which [emphasizes narratives and storytelling](#) to confront systemic racism and eschewed traditional social science methodologies. Post-2000s the field began to embrace qualitative methodologies and recently is currently considering [a quantitative turn](#), suggesting that perhaps quantitative data, as “numeric truth,” do not “exist independent of a nation’s political and racial landscape” therefore cannot be thought of as neutral.

An additional reason for the lack of quantitative research in this area has to do with [foundations and philanthropic organizations](#). While policymakers grow more interested in evidence-based programs and approaches, the complexities of research design combined with resource/cultural constraints in community-based research settings may result in unintended and undetected consequences, thus potentially reifying the extant disparities the programs and approaches seek to ameliorate.